BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055 Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 113002

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Kenneth Wilken, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Docket No:

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Fleck, Fleck & Fleck,

Defendant.

Kenneth Wilken, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Fleck, Fleck & Fleck (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).

3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff Kenneth Wilken is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.

6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).

7. On information and belief, Defendant Fleck, Fleck & Fleck, is a New York Professional Corporation with a principal place of business in Nassau County, New York.

8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.

9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").

11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).

12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.

13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.

14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated December 7, 2016. ("<u>Exhibit 1</u>.")

15. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).

16. The Letter states, "As of the date of this correspondence, the outstanding balance is \$1,506.34."

17. The Letter further states, "If this balance is not paid within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this correspondence, then be advised that this amount may increase due to the accrual of interest and/or costs."

18. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow Plaintiff to determine what Plaintiff will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.

19. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.

20. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of interest owed.

21. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the applicable interest rate.

22. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date of accrual of interest.

23. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of interest during any measurable period.

24. The Letter fails to contain an explanation, understandable by the least sophisticated consumer, of any fees and interest that may cause the amount stated to increase.

25. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of costs owed.

26. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the source of the costs.

27. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date costs will be applied.

28. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of costs that will be added during any measurable period.

29. The Letter fails to state what part of the amount stated is attributable to principal.

30. The Letter fails to state what part of the amount stated is attributable to interest.

31. The Letter fails to state what part of the amount stated is attributable to late fees.

32. The Letter fails to state what part of the amount stated is attributable to other fees.

33. The Letter fails to state what part of the amount stated is attributable to other costs

34. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the minimum amount owed at the time of the Letter.

35. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine what she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.

36. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of his or her debt.

37. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey the amount of the debt clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.

38. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey the amount of the debt accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.

39. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey the amount of

the debt without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.

40. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e. *See Balke v. Alliance One Receivables Management, Inc.*, No. 16-CV-5624(ADS)(AKT), 2017 WL 2634653 (E.D.N.Y. June 19, 2017).

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

41. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a collection letter that states, "If this balance is not paid within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this correspondence, then be advised that this amount may increase due to the accrual of interest and/or costs," from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.

42. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.

43. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.

44. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using a collection letter that states, "If this balance is not paid within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this correspondence, then be advised that this amount may increase due to the accrual of interest and/or costs."

45. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.

46. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.

47. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

48. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

a. Certify this action as a class action; and

b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and

c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and

d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and

e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. $\$ 1692k; and

f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with

g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: October 25, 2017

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: <u>/s/ Craig B. Sanders</u> Craig B. Sanders, Esq. 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055 csanders@barshaysanders.com Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 113002

Fleck, Fleck & Fleck

Attorneys at Law 1205 Franklin Avenue, Suite 300 Garden City, NY 11530 516-248-1080 Fax No. 516-248-1085 Raymond A. Fleck, Jr. Edward A. Fleck Patricia A. Fleck

December 7, 2016

CREDITOR: Slomin's Inc. FILE #: 0268 CLIENT ACCOUNT#: 9536 JUDGMENT BALANCE: \$1,506.34

As you may be aware our firm is handling the above claim. At this point the account remains unresolved. If you would like to resolve this matter or make payment arrangements please contact us. We look forward to your cooperation in resolving this matter.

As of the date of this correspondence, the outstanding balance is \$1,506.34. If this amount is paid within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this correspondence, our client will accept the same in full and final satisfaction of the debt. If this balance is not paid within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this correspondence, then be advised that this amount may increase due to the accrual of interest and/or costs.

Kenneth Wilken 34 Heston Road Shirley, NY 11967-2720

This communication is from a debt collector and is an attempt to collect a debt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS			DEFENDANTS	DEFENDANTS			
KENNETH WIL	KEN		FLECK, FLECK & FLECK				
(b) County of Residence of <i>(E)</i>	First Listed Plaintiff KCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CA	SUFFOLK ASES)		County of Residence of First Listed Defendant NASSAU (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.			
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A BARSHAY SAND 100 Garden City P (516) 203-7600			Attorneys (If Known)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in (One Box Only)	I. CITIZENSHIP OF P	PRINCIPAL PARTIES	Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff		
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government 1		(For Diversity Cases Only) P	TF DEF D 1 O 1 Incorporated <i>or</i> Pri of Business In T	and One Box for Defendant) PIF DEF ncipal Place O 4 O 4		
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi	p of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of Another State O	0 2 O 2 Incorporated and P of Business In A	•		
			Citizen or Subject of a C Foreign Country	O 3 O 3 Foreign Nation	O 6 O 6		
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		ly) DRTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES		
 0 110 Insurance 0 120 Marine 0 130 Miller Act 0 140 Negotiable Instrument 0 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 0 151 Medicare Act 0 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) 0 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 0 160 Stockholders' Suits 0 190 Other Contract 0 195 Contract Product Liability 0 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY 0 210 Land Condemnation 0 220 Foreclosure 0 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 0 245 Tort Product Liability 0 290 All Other Real Property 	 PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle O 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury O 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other O 448 Education 	 PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage O 385 Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 540 Mandamus & Other O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement 	 0 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 0 690 Other Construct the service of the service of	 0 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 0 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS 0 820 Copyrights 0 830 Patent 0 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY 0 861 HIA (1395ff) 0 862 Black Lung (923) 0 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) 0 864 SSID Title XVI 0 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS 0 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) 0 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609 	 0 375 False Claims Act 0 400 State Reapportionment 0 410 Antitrust 0 430 Banks and Banking 0 450 Commerce 0 460 Deportation 0 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations 0 480 Consumer Credit 0 490 Cable/Sat TV 0 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange 0 890 Other Statutory Actions 0 891 Agricultural Acts 0 893 Environmental Matters 0 895 Freedom of Information Act 0 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision 0 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes 		
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in • 1 Original O 2 Remo Proceeding Con	oved from State O 3 Rem		Reinstated or Reopened O 5 Transferry Recopened (specify)	District Litigation –	O 8 Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File		
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO		ise:	ling (<i>Do not cite jurisdictional st</i>	atutes unless diversity): 15 USC §	\$1692		
VII. REQUESTED IN		S A CLASS ACTION	DEMAND \$	CHECK YES only	y if demanded in complaint:		
COMPLAINT: UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P. VIII. RELATED CASE(S) (See Instructions) IF ANY JUDGE				JURY DEMAND: DOCKET NUMBER	• Yes O No		
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATTOR	NEY OF RECORD				
October 30, 2017 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY			/s Craig B. Sanders				
	IOUNT	APPLYING IFP	JUDGE	MAG. JUI	DGE		

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, <u>Craig B. Sanders</u>, counsel for <u>Plaintiff</u>, do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):

- □ monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
- \Box the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
- \Box the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1

Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:

RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)

Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."

NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)

1. Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: <u>NO</u>

If you answered "no" above:
a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County? <u>YES</u>

b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES

If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County?

(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).

BAR ADMISSION

I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.

Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court? Yes (If yes, please explain) No

I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature:	/s	Craig	B.	Sanders

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Kenneth Wilken, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated)))	
Plaintiff(s))	
)	Civil Action No.
V.)	
)	
Fleck, Fleck & Fleck)	
Defendant(s))	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) Fleck, Fleck & Fleck 1205 Franklin Avenue, Suite 300 Garden City, New York 11530

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) – or 60 days if you are the United States, or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

BARSHAY SANDERS PLLC 100 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 500 GARDEN CITY, NY 11530

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Three Flecks, You're Out: NY Debt Collector Fleck, Fleck & Fleck Hit with FDCPA Lawsuit</u>