BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 112511

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Jonathan Guerrero, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

VS.

Miller & Milone, P.C.,

Defendant.

Docket No:

CLASS-ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Jonathan Guerrero (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Miller & Milone, P.C. (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.
- 4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.
 - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant Miller & Milone, P.C., is a New York Professional Corporation with a principal place of business in Nassau County, New York.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
 - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).
 - 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated November 16, 2017. ("Exhibit 1.")
 - 15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.
 - 16. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
- 17. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representations or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- 18. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(10) specifically prohibits the "use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt."
- 19. A collection letter is deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it purports to be from a law firm without disclosing to the consumer information concerning "meaningful attorney involvement" in connection with the collection of the debt.
- 20. A collection letter is also deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer.
- 21. A collection letter purporting to be from a law firm is not deceptive so long as it contains a disclaimer such as the following: "At this time, no attorney with this firm has

personally reviewed the particular circumstances of your account."

- 22. The Letter identifies Defendant as "Miller & Milone P.C., Attorneys at Law."
- 23. The Letter contains no disclaimer, such as that set forth in Paragraph 21 above, concerning "meaningful attorney involvement" in connection with the collection of the debt.
- 24. Whether an attorney is personally involved in the collection of a debt is a material piece of information.
- 25. The least sophisticated consumer would likely reasonably, but inaccurately, interpret the Letter to mean that an attorney has personally reviewed the particular circumstances of Plaintiff's account.
- 26. The least sophisticated consumer would likely reasonably, but inaccurately, interpret the Letter to mean that an attorney is personally involved in the attempted collection of Plaintiff's debt.
- 27. The least sophisticated consumer, because of the aforementioned failures, would likely be deceived by the Letter.
- 28. The least sophisticated consumer, because of the aforementioned failures, would likely be deceived by the Letter in a material way.
 - 29. Defendant's conduct, as described above, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.
 - 30. Defendant's conduct, as described above, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(10).

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

- 31. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt in a deceptive manner, as described above, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 32. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.
 - 33. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.
- 34. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts in a deceptive manner, as described above.
- 35. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over

any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.

- 36. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.
- 37. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

38. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with

g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: November 16, 2017

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: _/s/ Craig B. Sanders Craig B. Sanders, Esq. 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600

Fax: (516) 706-5055 csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 112511

Case 2:17-cv-06746 Doctornent_E-it & Fivetl_10/11 E/1P.CP.age 1 of 3 PageID #: 6

ATTORNEYS AT LAW 100 Quentin Roosevelt Blvd. Suite 205 Garden City, New York 11530 Office: 516 296-1060 Fax: 516 296-1063

CHRISTINA MILONE
TAMMY ROSE LAWLOR
ALICIA A. WEISSMEIER[†]
ELIZABETH MURPHY
DONNA F SHEIDLOWER
SARA O'CONNOR
GILLIAN BALLENTINE-ALMAN[‡]
ROSS C STEELE[‡]
'ADMITTED IN NY & NJ

GUY R. MILONE, JR. OF COUNSEL GEORGE T. MILLER 1936-2010

November 16, 2016

JONATHAN GUERRERO 2 WHITMORE LANE PH CORAM, NY 11727

RE: THE NEW YORK AND PRESBYTERIAN HOSPITAL

8346

Dear Sir / Madam:

This office represents THE NEW YORK AND PRESBYTERIAN HOSPITAL in connection with your outstanding bill. Please provide us with any insurance or other payment information that may assist us in resolving this matter.

Please indicate if you would like this hospital service to be considered for one of the Hospital's Financial Assistance Programs or Charity Care Programs.

Very truly yours,

Miller & Milone, P.C. Account Representative: Antonio Servellon

Ext: 307

Account Information:

Patient: <u>JONATHAN GUERRERO</u>

Hospital Account: 9284

Account: 8346
Date of Service: 03/25/2016

Balance Due: \$200.00

THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT A DEBT. ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED WILL BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSE. THIS CORRESPONDENCE IS FROM A DEBT COLLECTOR.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice that the debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, we will obtain verification of the debt or a copy of a judgment and we will mail a copy of such verification or judgment to you. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

Case 2:17-qv-2014/60 RRCRIECOLVERIVE SERVICE SAIN C. of 3 PageID #: 7

P.O. Box 28898 New York, NY 10087-8898

ACCOUNT IDENTIFICATION

Client Name: Patient Name: NewYork-Presbyterian/Columbia University Medical Center

JONATHAN GUERRERO

Account #:

Hospital #:

B990

9768

Date(s) Of Service:

06/27/16

Balance Due:

\$30.00

DEMAND FOR PAYMENT

The above referenced client has assigned your past due account to our agency for collection. Your account is listed as delinquent with a balance due in the amount of \$30.00. It is important that you make payment in full.

If your account has already been paid, please provide us with proof of payment. Please send a copy of your cancelled check, money order receipt, payment receipt or copy of the explanation of benefits provided by your insurance carrier.

If your account has not been paid you may send your check or money order or pay by using one of the Credit Cards indicated below. If you have (had) valid insurance for the dates of service that you believe covers these charges, please complete the insurance information section on the reverse side of the return portion of this notice. Please detach the bottom portion of this notice and forward it with your payment or correspondence in the envelope provided.

Although we have requested that you make payment, or provide proof of payment if payment has been made, you still have a right to dispute this debt, either orally or in writing, and to obtain more information about the debt. YOUR RIGHTS ARE DESCRIBED ON THE REVERSE SIDE OF THIS NOTICE.

IF YOU ARE EXPERIENCING FINANCIAL HARDSHIP AND ARE UNABLE TO PAY THIS BILL, CHARITY CARE MAY BE AVAILABLE IF YOU QUALIFY. PLEASE CONTACT US TO OBTAIN INFORMATION ABOUT CHARITY CARE AND HOW TO APPLY FOR IT.

Sincerely,

JULIETTE MCGHEE Account Representative 516-240-6602

THIS IS A COMMUNICATION FROM A DEBT COLLECTOR. THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT A DEBT. ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED WILL BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSE.

Detach and Return with Payment or Correspondence

IONNREC01500

, e

ONNREC01 PO Box 1022

Wixom MI 48393-1022

ADDRESS SERVICE REQUESTED

Client Name:

NewYork-Presbyterian/Columbia University Medical Center JONATHAN GUERRERO

Patient Name:

8990

Account #:

Hospital #: Date(s) Of Service: 06/27/16

9768

Balance Due:

\$30.00

November 15, 2016

500

272845180

ՈՒԻՎՈՒԱՈՒՈՐԻ ԱՐԵՐԻ ԱՐԵՐ

JONATHAN GUERRERO 2 Whitmore Ln PH Coram NY 11727-1028

MAIL ALL CORRESPONDENCE TO: **NETWORK RECOVERY SERVICES INC** P.O. Box 28898 New York, NY 10087-8898

	VISA	IF PAYING BY CREDIT CARD, FILL OUT BELOW		
	Market Care	CARD NUMBER		
	Olice Meg	CARD HOLDER NAME	EXP. DATE	
u	14 × 4	SIGNATURE	AMOUNT AUTHORIZED	
	Card	u		

If you do not dispute the validity of the debt, or any portion thereof, either orally or in writing, within thirty days after you receive this notice we will assume this to be a valid debt owed by you.

If you notify us in writing within thirty days after you receive this notice that the debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, we will obtain verification of this debt or a copy of a judgment and mail a copy of such verification or judgment to you.

In the event the name and address of the current creditor is different from the original creditor, and you, within thirty days after you receive this notice, request in writing the name and address of the original creditor, we will supply this information to you.

INSURANCE INFORMATION

PATIENT'S NAME			DATE OF B	RTH	SOCIAL	SECURITY NUMBER
BLUE CROSS/BLUE SHIELD ID NO.			SUFFIX		YOUR T	ELEPHONE NUMBER
INSURANCE COMPANY NAME & ADDRESS (INCLUDE SIGNED CLAIM FORM)						
POLICY NUMBER	POLICYHOLDER'S NAME			RELATION TO PATIENT		POLICYHOLDER'S DATE OF BIRTH
NAME, ADDRESS AND TELEPHONE NUMBER OF INSURED'S EMPLOYER						
MEDICAID ID NUMBER		MEDICARE ID NUME	BER		SUFFI	

provided by local rules of court. purpose of initiating the civil do	This form, approved by the ocket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	ne Judicial Conference of the CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE (ne United States in Septemb OF THIS FORM.)	er 1974, is required for the use of	the Clerk of Court for the	
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS			DEFENDANTS MILLER & MILONE, P.C. County of Residence of First Listed Defendant NASSAU (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.			
JONATHAN GU	ERRERO					
(b) County of Residence of 1	First Listed Plaintiff KCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CA	SUFFOLK ASES)				
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A BARSHAY SAND 100 Garden City P (516) 203-7600	-		Attorneys (If Kno	wn)		
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in 0	One Box Only)	II. CITIZENSHIP OI	F PRINCIPAL PARTIES	(Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff	
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff			(For Diversity Cases Only) Citizen of This State	PTF DEF O 1 O 1 Incorporated or Pr of Business In 7	and One Box for Defendant) PIF DEF rincipal Place O 4 O 4	
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)		Citizen of Another State	O 2 O 2 Incorporated and of Business In A	=	
W. MARYIDE OF GUYE			Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	O 3 O 3 Foreign Nation	O 6 O 6	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT CONTRACT		ly) ORTS	FORFEITURE/PENAL	TY BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES	
Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment O 240 Torts to Land O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property	rice PERSONAL INJURY e O 310 Airplane O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability e cement of Judgment are Act O 30 Federal Employers' Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability etery of Defaulted int Loans O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability O 360 Motor Vehicle O 350 Motor Vehicle O 350 Motor Vehicle O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 360 Other Personal Injury Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury O 360 Other Personal Injury O 362 Personal Injury O 362 Personal Injury O 365 Property Damage O 370 Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury O 360 Other Personal O 370 Other Personal O 380 Other Personal O 38		LABOR Y O 710 Fair Labor Standards Act O 720 Labor/Management Relations O 740 Railway Labor Act O 751 Family and Medical Leave Act O 790 Other Labor Litigation O 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION O 462 Naturalization Applica O 465 Other Immigration Actions	O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS O 820 Copyrights O 830 Patent O 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY O 861 HIA (1395ff) O 862 Black Lung (923) O 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) O 864 SSID Title XVI O 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS O 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) O 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	OTHER STATUTES O 375 False Claims Act O 400 State Reapportionment O 410 Antitrust O 430 Banks and Banking O 450 Commerce O 460 Deportation O 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations • 480 Consumer Credit O 490 Cable/Sat TV O 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange O 890 Other Statutory Actions O 891 Agricultural Acts O 893 Environmental Matters O 895 Freedom of Information Act O 896 Arbitration O 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision O 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes	
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in 1 Original Proceeding O 2 Remo Cou	oved from State O 3 Ren	urt	Reopened Anot (spec	Transies	O 8 Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO		use:	filing (Do not cite jurisdiction	al statutes unless diversity): 15 USC Act Violation	§1692	
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: • CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.			DEMAND \$	DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND : • Yes ○ No		
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	S(S)	(See Instructions) JUDGE		DOCKET NUMBER_		
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATTO	RNEY OF RECORD /s Craig B. Sander			
November 17, 2017 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY			/5 Clarg D. Sander	o .		
RECEIPT #AM	IOUNT	APPLYING IFP	JUDG	E MAG. JU	DGE	

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, <u>Craig B. Sanders</u> , counsel for <u>Plaintiff</u> , do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):
☐ monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
☐ the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
☐ the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1
Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:
RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)
Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."
NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)
 Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO
 If you answered "no" above: a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County?YES
b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES
If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County?
(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).
BAR ADMISSION
I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court. Yes No
Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court? Yes (If yes, please explain) No
I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature: <u>/s Craig B. Sanders</u>

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

fo	r the
EASTERN DISTRI	ICT OF <u>NEW YORK</u>
Jonathan Guerrero, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated, Plaintiff(s) V.	
Miller & Milone, P.C. Defendant(s)	_)
SUMMONS IN A	A CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address) Miller & Milone, P.C. 100 Quentin Roosevelt Blvd, Suite 205 Garden City, New York 11530	
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
Within 21 days after service of this summon 60 days if you are the United States, or a United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's	you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the E Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or
100 GARDEN CITY	ANDERS PLLC Y PLAZA, SUITE 500 TY, NY 11530
If you fail to respond, judgment by default we the complaint. You also must file your answer or me	vill be entered against you for the relief demanded in otion with the court.
	CLERK OF COURT
Date:	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: Miller & Milone Sued Over Sending Allegedly Misleading Collection Letter