NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

#### **SHORT FORM ORDER**

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK

PRESENT: HON. DENISE L. SHER Supreme Court Justice

CLAIR AWAD and SHANE MANNION, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Inday No. 41

Plaintiffs,

Index No.: 610563/2024 Motion Seq. No.: 01 Motion Date: 09/09/2024

TRIAL/IAS PART 30

NASSAU COUNTY

- against -

FANDANGO MEDIA, LLC,

Defendant.

The following papers have been read on this motion:

Papers Numbered

Notice of Motion, Affirmation and Exhibits, Memorandum of Law

the Proposed Notice, is hereby **GRANTED**. And it is further

\_\_\_\_\_\_

Upon the foregoing papers, it is ordered that the motion is decided as follows:

Plaintiffs' unopposed motion, pursuant to Article 9 of the CPLR, for an order

(i) granting preliminary approval of the Class Action Settlement; (ii) provisionally certifying the Settlement Class under CPLR 902 in connection with the settlement process;

(iii) appointing Philip L. Fraietta and Stefan Bogdanovich of Bursor & Fisher, P.A.

as Class Counsel; (iv) appointing Clair Awad and Shane Mannion as the Class Representatives for the Settlement Class; (v) approving the Notice Plan for the Class Action Settlement described in the Class Action Settlement Agreement and its Exhibits, as well as the specific Notice of Class Action and Proposed Settlement (the 'Proposed Notice'), attached as Exhibits B-C to the Settlement Agreement, and directing distribution of

COUNTY

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

INDEX NO. 610563/2024 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

ORDERED, DECREED, AND ADJUDGED AS FOLLOWS:

1. Terms and phrases in this Order shall have the same meaning as ascribed to them in the Settlement Agreement.

2. The Parties have moved the Court for an order approving the settlement of the Action in accordance with the Settlement Agreement, which, together with the documents incorporated therein, sets forth the terms and conditions for a proposed settlement and dismissal of the Action with prejudice, and the Court having read and considered the Settlement Agreement and having heard the parties and being fully advised in the premises, hereby preliminarily approves the Settlement Agreement in its entirety subject to the Final Approval Hearing referred to in paragraph 5 of this Order.

- 3. This Court finds that it has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and over all Parties to the Action.
- 4. The Court preliminarily finds that, subject to the Final Approval Hearing, the Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable, and adequate, within the range of possible approval, and in the best interests of the Settlement Class set forth below. The Court further preliminarily finds that the Settlement Agreement substantially fulfills the purposes and objectives of the class action, and provides substantial relief to the Settlement Class without the risks, burdens, costs, or delay associated with continued litigation, trial, and/or appeal. The Court also finds that the Settlement Agreement (a) is the result of arm's-length negotiations between experienced class action attorneys; (b) is sufficient to warrant notice of the settlement and the Final Approval Hearing to be disseminated to the Settlement Class; (c) meets all applicable requirements of law, including CPLR Article 9;

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

and (d) is not a finding or admission of liability by the Defendant or any other person, nor a finding of the validity of any claims asserted in the Action or of any wrongdoing or any violation of law.

## Final Approval Hearing

- 5. The Final Approval Hearing shall be held before this Court on **February 27, 2025**, at 9:00 a.m., IAS Part 30 at the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of Nassau, 100 Supreme Court Drive, Mineola, NY to determine (a) whether the proposed settlement of the Action on the terms and conditions provided for in the Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable, and adequate and should be given final approval by the Court:
- (b) whether a judgment and order of dismissal with prejudice should be entered;
- (c) whether to approve the payment of attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses to Class Counsel; and (d) whether to approve the payment of service awards to the Class Representatives.

  The Court may adjourn the Final Approval Hearing without further notice to members of the Settlement Class.
- 6. Class Counsel shall file papers in support of their Fee Award and Class Representatives' Service Awards (collectively, the "Fee Petition") with the Court on or before **December 16, 2024**. Defendant may, but is not required to, file a response to Class Counsel's Fee Petition with the Court on or before **February 6, 2025**. Class Counsel may file a reply in support of their Fee Petition with the Court on or before **February 13, 2025**.
- 7. Papers in support of final approval of the Settlement Agreement shall be filed with the Court on or before **February 6, 2025**.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

#### **Certification of the Settlement Class**

- 8. For purposes of settlement only: (a) Philip L. Fraietta and Stefan Bogdanovich of Bursor & Fisher, P.A. are appointed Class Counsel for the Settlement Class; and (b) Clair Awad and Shane Mannion are named Class Representatives. The Court finds that these attorneys are competent and capable of exercising the responsibilities of Class Counsel and that Plaintiffs will adequately protect the interests of the Settlement Class defined below.
- 9. For purposes of settlement only, the Court conditionally certifies the following Settlement Class as defined in the Settlement Agreement:

All individuals in the United States who purchased electronic tickets and paid a convenience fee to any movie in any movie theater located within New York state from Fandango's website, mobile phone application, and/or any other Fandango owned or operated online platform from August 29, 2022, to and through March 11, 2024.

10. The Court preliminarily finds, subject to the Final Approval Hearing referred to in Paragraph 5 above, that the Settlement Agreement is fundamentally fair, adequate, and reasonable, and, solely within the context of and for the purposes of settlement only, that the Settlement Class satisfies the requirements of CPLR 901, specifically, that: the Settlement Class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable; there are questions of fact and law common to the Settlement Class (*e.g.*, whether Defendant failed to adequately disclose the total price (including the convenience fee) and the convenience fee in violation of New York Arts & Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07(4); and whether the displayed price of Defendant's tickets

Excluded from the Settlement Class are (1) any Judge or Magistrate presiding over this Action and members of their families; (2) the Defendant, Defendant's subsidiaries, parent companies, successors, predecessors, and any entity in which the Defendant or its parents have a controlling interest and their current or former officers, directors, agents, attorneys, and employees; (3) persons who properly execute and file a timely request for exclusion from the class; and (4) the legal representatives, successors or assigns of any such excluded persons.

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

increased during the purchase process in violation of New York Arts & Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07(4)); the claims of the Class Representatives are typical of the claims of the members of the Settlement Class; the Class Representatives and Class Counsel will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the members of the Settlement Class; common questions of law or fact predominate over questions affecting individual members; and a class action is a superior method for fairly and efficiently adjudicating the Action.

approval is reversed or vacated on appeal, or if the Settlement Agreement is terminated or otherwise fails to become effective, the Court's grant of class certification shall be vacated, and the Class Representatives and the Settlement Class will once again bear the burden of establishing the propriety of class certification. In such case, neither the certification of the Settlement Class for settlement purposes, nor any other act relating to the negotiation or execution of the Settlement Agreement or the motion for preliminary approval shall be considered as a factor in connection with any class certification issue(s).

### Notice and Administration

12. The Court approves, as to form, content, and distribution, the Notice Plan set forth in the Settlement Agreement, including Claim Form attached to the Settlement Agreement as Exhibit A, the Notice Plan and all forms of Notice to the Settlement Class as set forth in the Settlement Agreement and Exhibits B and C, thereto, and finds that such Notice is the best notice practicable under the circumstances, and that the Notice complies fully with the requirements of CPLR 904 and 908. The Court also finds that the Notice constitutes valid, due, and sufficient notice to all persons entitled thereto, and meets the requirements of Due Process. The Court further finds that the Notice is reasonably calculated to, under all circumstances, reasonably

COUNTY CLERK 10/31/2024

the Settlement Agreement.

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

apprise members of the Settlement Class of the pendency of this action, the terms of the Settlement Agreement, and the right to object to the settlement and to exclude themselves from the Settlement Class. In addition, the Court finds that no notice other than that specifically identified in the Settlement Agreement is necessary in this Action. The Parties, by agreement, may revise the Notice and Claim Form in ways that are not material. or in ways that are appropriate to update those documents for purposes of accuracy or formatting. 13. The Court approves the request for the appointment of Epiq as Settlement Administrator of

14. Pursuant to paragraph 4.1 of the Settlement Agreement, the Settlement Administrator is directed to publish the Notice and Claim Form on the Settlement Website and to send direct notice via email in accordance with the Notice Plan called for by the Settlement Agreement. The Settlement Administrator shall also maintain the Settlement Website to provide full information about the Settlement and allow for the filing of claims online. The Notice Date is November 29, 2024.

# Submission of Claims and Requests for Exclusion from Class

15. Members of the Class who wish to receive benefits under the Settlement Agreement must complete and submit a timely and valid Claim Form(s) in accordance with the instructions contained therein. All Claim Forms must be postmarked or received by the Settlement Administrator no later than thirty (30) days after the Final Approval Hearing. 16. Any person falling within the definition of the Settlement Class may, upon valid and timely request, exclude themselves or "opt out" from the Class. Any such person may do so if, on or before the Objection/Exclusion Deadline of January 28, 2025 they comply with

COUNTY

INDEX NO. 610563/2024 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

the exclusion procedures set forth in the Settlement Agreement and Notice. Any members of the Class so excluded shall neither be bound by the terms of

the Settlement Agreement nor entitled to any of its benefits.

17. Any members of the Settlement Class who elect to exclude themselves or "opt out" of

the Settlement Agreement must file a written request with the Settlement Administrator,

received or postmarked no later than the Objection/Exclusion Deadline.

The request for exclusion must comply with the exclusion procedures set forth in

the Settlement Agreement and Notice and include the Settlement Class member's name and

address, a signature, a statement that he/she paid a convenience fee to purchase electronic tickets

to any movie in any movie theater located within New York state from Fandango's website,

mobile phone application, and/or any other Fandango owned or operated online platform

from August 29, 2022, to and through March 11, 2024, and a statement that he or she

wishes to be excluded from the Settlement Class for purposes of this Settlement.

Each request for exclusion must be submitted individually. So called "mass" or "class" opt-outs

shall not be allowed.

18. Individuals who opt out of the Class relinquish all rights to benefits under

the Settlement Agreement and will not release their claims. However, members of

the Settlement Class who fail to submit a valid and timely request for exclusion shall be bound

by all terms of the Settlement Agreement and the Final Judgment, regardless of whether

they have requested exclusion from the Settlement Agreement.

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

Appearances and Objections

19. At least twenty-one (21) calendar days before the Final Approval Hearing, any person who falls within the definition of the Settlement Class and who does not request exclusion from the Class may enter an appearance in the Action, at their own expense, individually or through counsel of their own choice. Any Settlement Class Member who does not enter an appearance will be represented by Class Counsel.

20. Any members of the Settlement Class who have not timely filed a request for exclusion may object to the fairness, reasonableness, or adequacy of the Settlement Agreement or to a Final Judgment being entered dismissing the Action with prejudice in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement, or to the attorneys' fees and expense reimbursement sought by Class Counsel in the amounts specified in the Notice, or to the award to the Class Representatives as set forth in the Notice and Settlement Agreement.

At least fourteen (14) days prior to the Objection/Exclusion Deadline, papers supporting the Fee Award shall be filed with the court and posted to the settlement website.

Members of the Class may object on their own, or may do so through separate counsel at their own expense.

21. To object, members of the Class must sign and file a written objection on or before the Objection/Exclusion Deadline of **January 28**, **2025**. To be valid, the objection must comply with the objection procedures set forth in the Settlement Agreement and Notice, and include his or her name and address; an explanation of the basis upon which he or she claims to be a Settlement Class Member; a signature; all grounds for the objection, including all citations to legal authority and evidence supporting the objection; the name and contact information of any and all attorneys representing, advising.

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

YSCEF DOC. NO. 15 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

or in any way assisting him or her in connection with the preparation or submission of the objection or who may profit from the pursuit of the objection (the "Objecting Attorneys"); and a statement indicating whether he or she intends to appear at the Final Approval Hearing (either personally or through counsel who files an appearance with the Court in accordance with the Court Rules). If a Settlement Class Member or any of the Objecting Attorneys has objected to any class action settlement where the objector or the Objecting Attorneys asked for or received any payment in exchange for dismissal of the objection, or any related appeal, without any modification to the settlement, then the objection must include a statement identifying each such case by full case caption.

- 22. Members of the Class who fail to file and serve timely written objections in compliance with the requirements of this paragraph and the Settlement Agreement shall be deemed to have waived any objections and shall be foreclosed from making any objections (whether by appeal or otherwise) to the Settlement Agreement or to any of the subjects listed in paragraph 5, above, *i.e.* (a) whether the proposed settlement of the Action on the terms and conditions provided for in the Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable, and adequate and should be given final approval by the Court; (b) whether a judgment and order of dismissal with prejudice should be entered; (c) whether to approve the payment of attorneys' fees and expenses to Class Counsel; and (d) whether to approve the payment of service awards to the Class Representatives.
- 23. To be valid, objections must be filed with the Court and sent to the following:
  Class Counsel, Philip L. Fraietta, Bursor & Fisher, P.A., 1330 Avenue of the Americas,
  32<sup>nd</sup> Floor, New York, NY 10019; and Defendant's Counsel, Christine M. Reilly,
  Manatt, Phelps & Phillips, LLP, 2049 Century Park East, Suite 1700, Los Angeles, CA 90067.

COUNTY CLERK 10/31/2024

INDEX NO. 610563/2024 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

In addition, any objections made by a Class member represented by counsel must be filed through the Court's electronic filing system.

## Further Matters

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

- 24. All further proceedings in the Action are ordered stayed until Final Judgment or termination of the Settlement Agreement, whichever occurs earlier, except for those matters necessary to obtain and/or effectuate final approval of the Settlement Agreement. Defendant's time to answer, move or otherwise respond to the complaint herein is hereby tolled effective from the date of the execution of the Term Sheet.
- 25. Members of the Settlement Class shall be bound by all determinations and judgments in the Action concerning the Action and/or Settlement Agreement, whether favorable or unfavorable.
- 26. The Court retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or connected with the proposed Settlement Agreement. The Court may approve the Settlement, with such modifications as may be agreed to by the Parties, if appropriate, without further notice to the Class.
- 27. All Settlement Class Members who do not timely exclude themselves from the Settlement: (a) shall be bound by the provisions of the Settlement Agreement and all proceedings, determinations, orders and judgments in the Action relating thereto, including, without limitation, the Judgment or Alternate Judgment, if applicable, and the Releases provided for therein, whether favorable or unfavorable to the Class; and (b) to the fullest extent permitted by law, shall forever be barred and enjoined from directly or indirectly filing, commencing, instituting, prosecuting, maintaining, participating in (as a class member or

COUNTY

INDEX NO. 610563/2024 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

otherwise), or intervening in any lawsuit, action, cause of action, arbitration, claim, demand, or other proceeding in any jurisdiction, whether in the United States or elsewhere, on their own behalf or in a representative capacity, that is related to or arises out of any or all of the Released Claims against Defendant and/or any of the Released Parties, as more fully described in the Settlement Agreement.

- 28. If the Settlement Agreement is not approved by the Court in complete accordance with its terms, each party will have the option of having the Action revert to its status as if the Settlement Agreement had not been negotiated, made, or filed with the Court. In such event, the parties will retain all rights as if the Settlement Agreement was never agreed upon.
- 29. The Court hereby authorizes the Parties, without further approval from the Court, to agree to and adopt such amendments, modifications and expansions of the Settlement Agreement and its implementing documents (including Exhibits A, B, C, and D to the Settlement Agreement) so long as they are consistent in all material respects with the terms of the Settlement Agreement and do not limit or impair the rights of the Settlement Class or materially expand the obligations of Defendant.
- 30. If the Settlement Agreement is terminated pursuant to the provisions of the Settlement Agreement or for any reason whatsoever the approval of it does not become Final then (i) the Settlement Agreement shall be null and void, including any provision related to the award of attorneys' fees, and shall have no further force and effect with respect to any party in this Action, and shall not be used in this Action or in any other proceeding for any purpose; (ii) all negotiations, proceedings, documents prepared, and statements made in connection therewith, including the submissions made in support of preliminary approval, shall be without prejudice to any person or party hereto, shall not be deemed or construed to be

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 15

INDEX NO. 610563/2024

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/30/2024

an admission by any party of any act, matter, or proposition, and shall not be used in any manner

or for any purpose in any subsequent proceeding in this Action or in any other action in any court

or other proceeding, provided, however, that the termination of the Settlement Agreement

shall not shield from subsequent discovery any factual information provided in connection with

the negotiation of this Settlement Agreement that would ordinarily be discoverable but for

the attempted settlement; and (iii) other than as expressly preserved by the Settlement Agreement

in the event of its termination, the Settlement Agreement shall have no further force and effect

with respect to any party and shall not be used in the Action or any other proceeding for any

purpose.

29. Stay of Proceedings. All proceedings in this Action are stayed until further order of

the Court, except as may be necessary to implement the Settlement or comply with the terms of

the Settlement. Pending determination of whether the Settlement should be granted

final approval, no party shall pursue in this Action any claims or defenses otherwise available to

them in the Action, and no Settlement Class Member, either directly, on a representative basis,

or in any other capacity, will commence or prosecute against Defendant or any of

the Released Parties any action or proceeding asserting any of the Released Claims.

This constitutes the Decision and Order of this Court.

ENTER:

DENISE L. SHER, J.S.C.

ENTERED

Dated: Mineola, New York October 30, 2024

er 30, 2024 Oct 31 2024

NASSAU COUNTY COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE